

## **FINAL MINUTES**

### **JOINT MEETING of the STATE REVIEW BOARD and HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD March 8, 2006, 10:00 a.m.**

Halsey Lecture Hall, Virginia Historical Society  
428 North Boulevard, Richmond, Virginia 23221

#### **State Review Board Members Present**

Warren Hofstra, Chair  
Ann Alexander  
Carl Lounsbury  
Madison Spencer

#### **Historic Resources Board Members Present**

Patrick Butler, Vice-Chair (Acting-Chair)  
John Braymer  
Jeanne Evans  
Rachel Flynn  
Ora McCoy  
Helen Murphy

#### **Department of Historic Resources Staff Present**

Kathleen Kilpatrick, Director  
Catherine Slusser, Deputy Director  
Ann Andrus  
Scott Arnold  
Camille Bowman  
David Edwards  
Joanie Evans  
Quatro Hubbard  
Randy Jones

Calder Loth  
Jean McRae  
Michael Pulice  
Olga Skorackyj  
Susan Smead  
Elizabeth Tune  
Marc Wagner

## **JOINT SESSION**

#### **State Review Board (SRB)**

Chair Hofstra called the State Review Board meeting to order shortly after 10:00 a.m. and welcomed everyone in attendance. He explained the role of the board then asked the members to introduce themselves.

The minutes from the December 7, 2005 meeting were approved with a motion from Mr. Spencer and a second from Mr. Lounsbury. There was no old or new business.

#### **Historic Resources Board (HRB)**

Vice-Chair Butler, Acting Chair for this meeting, called the Historic Resources Board meeting to order and welcomed everyone in attendance. He explained the role of the board then asked each member to introduce themselves.

The minutes from the December 7, 2005 meeting were approved with a motion from Mr. Braymer and a second from Ms. Murphy. There was no old business. Under new business, Vice-Chair Butler read a resolution for Ms. Sandra Dixon Speiden, a past board member. The resolution was approved with a motion from Ms. McCoy and a second from Ms. Evans.

#### **Director's Report (DHR)**

Director Kilpatrick welcomed everyone in attendance and commented on some internal issues. She mentioned HRB Member Ms. Flynn's move to Richmond City as Director of Community Development, and welcomed two new DHR staff, Ms. Skorackyj, Administrative Assistant, and Dr. Spradley-Kurowski, Register Historian. She reminded the board of the General Assembly's reauthorization of a State Archaeologist position and announced that Dr. Michael Barber had been selected after a nationwide search to fill the position. She provided the Boards with updates on subjects of interest such as; Fort Monroe, easement and budget issues at both the state and federal levels, legislative updates, and the upcoming cost-share projects. Finally, Director Kilpatrick highlighted some of the state initiatives and referenced some of the nominations on the day's agenda.

### **Presentation of Register Nominations**

Chair Hofstra thanked Director Kilpatrick and explained the procedures of approval for each of the Boards.

#### **Ms. Andrus presented the following for the Capital Region:**

1. Auburn, Caroline County, DHR File #171-0008, Criterion C
2. The Cove, Halifax County, DHR File #041-5086, Criteria A, B, C, and D
3. Edgewood, Nelson County, DHR File #062-0004, Criteria A, B, and C
4. Estes Farm, Albemarle County, DHR File #002-0524, Criteria A and C
5. Fraternal Order of Eagles Building, City of Richmond, DHR File #127-5885, Criteria A and C
6. Hebrew Cemetery, City of Richmond, DHR File #127-6166, Criteria A and C w/ Consideration A, D, and G
7. Charles B. Holt House, City of Charlottesville, DHR File #104-5098, Criteria A, B, and C
8. Limestone Farm, Albemarle County, DHR File #002-0090, Criteria B, C, and D
9. Lock Lane Apartments, City of Richmond, DHR File #127-6170, Criterion C
10. Oakland, Nelson County, DHR File #062-0052, Criteria A and C
11. Richmond and Chesapeake Bay Railway Car Barn, City of Richmond, DHR File #127-6171, Criteria A, C

Chair Hofstra asked for comments from the Boards. Mr. Spencer mentioned his questions regarding the Estes Farm and The Cove nominations had been addressed. Ms. Andrus assured the Boards that Ms. Heath's previous comments on The Cove nomination had also been addressed, and Chair Hofstra asked that DHR provide Ms. Heath a final draft of the nomination before it went to the NPS. Ms. Rosenbaum of the Hebrew Cemetery thanked the Boards and said she was there to answer any questions. Dr. Bluestone of UVA said he was there to answer any questions for the C.B. Holt House.

With a motion from Mr. Lounsbury and a second from Ms. Alexander, all the Capital Region nominations were approved by the SRB for recommendation to the NPS. Then with a motion from Ms. Murphy and a second from Ms. McCoy the HRB approved all the Capital Region nominations for listing in the Virginia Landmarks Register (VLR).

#### **Mr. Wagner presented the following nomination for the Tidewater Region:**

12. Sharon Indian School, King William County, DHR File #050-5005, Criteria A and D

Mr. Wagner explained the process by which this nomination had come to DHR and those involved with the nomination and the school. Both he and Chair Hofstra acknowledged Chief Kenneth Adams and Dr. Julie Earnstein for their contributions to the nomination. Dr. Earnstein went on record to say she had spoken with Ms. Seibert of the NPS regarding the nomination and would like DHR to ask NPS for a substantive archaeological review when they review the nomination for listing to the National Register of Historic Places. Chief Adams thanked all those involved with the nomination and explained some of his family and social connections to the school.

Chair Hofstra said it was the Boards' and DHR staff's privilege to consider the nomination, and with a motion from Mr. Spencer and a second from Mr. Lounsbury, the Sharon Indian School nomination was approved by the SRB for recommendation to the NPS. Then with a motion from Dr. Braymer and a second from Ms. McCoy the HRB approved the nomination for listing in the Virginia Landmarks Register (VLR).

#### **Ms. Bowman presented the following nominations for the Tidewater Region:**

13. Benjamin's Department Store, Northampton County, DHR File #065-0528, Criterion C
14. Selma, Northampton County, DHR File #065-0077, Criterion C

With a motion from Ms. Alexander and a second from Mr. Lounsbury the remaining Tidewater Region nominations were approved by the SRB for recommendation to the NPS. Then with a motion from Ms. Evans and a second from Ms. Murphy the HRB approved the two nominations for listing in the Virginia Landmarks Register (VLR).

#### **Mr. Pulice presented the following nominations for the Roanoke Region:**

15. Euclid Avenue Historic District, City of Bristol, DHR File #102-5022, Criterion C
16. Glasgow Historic District, Boundary Increase, Rockbridge County, DHR File #223-0003, Criteria A and C
17. Preston House, Boundary Increase Amendment, City of Salem, DHR File 129-5018, Criterion C
18. Shannon Cemetery, Giles County, DHR File # 035-5028, Criteria A and C with Criterion Consideration D

Chair Hofstra checked that Ms. Heath's previous comments on the Shannon Cemetery nomination had been taken care of and he was assured that she had indeed read and approved the current draft of the nomination. There was some discussion regarding the term "airplane bungalow" and the description of a Lustron House.

With a motion from Mr. Spencer and a second from Mr. Lounsbury all the Roanoke Region nominations were approved by the SRB for recommendation to the NPS. Then with a motion from Dr. Braymer and a second from Ms. McCoy all the Roanoke Region nominations were approved by the HRB for listing in the VLR.

**Mr. Edwards presented the following nominations for the Winchester Region:**

19. Breneman/Turner Mill, Rockingham County, DHR File #082-0023, Criteria A and C
20. Ralph Bunche High School, King George County, DHR File #048-5007, Criterion A
21. Fort Collier, Frederick County, DHR File #034-0165, Criteria A, C, and D
22. Myrtle Hall Farm, Loudoun County, DHR File #053-1059, Criteria A and C
23. Paeonian Springs Historic District, Loudoun County, DHR File #053-5072, Criteria A and C
24. Tower House, Fairfax County, DHR File #029-0151, Criterion C
25. Westover Historic District, Arlington County, DHR File #000-0032, Criteria A and C

Chair Butler asked for clarification on the Fort Collier nomination regarding General Lee and Major Whiting. He also asked that the Ralph Bunche High School nomination Period of Significance date carry through 1967, the actual date when the school stopped being used as a school. Both he and Director Kilpatrick expressed the sensibility of carrying a Period of Significance through to its logical end regardless of the "50 year" cut-off rule. Ms. Alexander stated that the history section of the Bunche School nomination was very good. Mr. Tyler, a 1955 graduate from the school, introduced the folks that had come to support and celebrate the nomination and thanked all involved. He also provided some more background to the importance of the school in the county and state, and he pointed out the school actually closed at the end of the 1967 school year in 1968. Ms. Lewis provided some incite as to the future of the school and the county's contribution.

Mr. Martin, a 5<sup>th</sup> generation member of the Breneman family, thanked everyone for the consideration of the Breneman Mill nomination. Mr. Weaver talked of the listing process and donation of the mill to the Mennonite Heritage Center, and thanked the staff and Board member for their assistance.

With a motion from Mr. Lounsbury and a second from Ms. Alexander, all the Winchester Region nominations were approved by the SRB for recommendation to the NPS. Then with a motion from Ms. Murphy and a second from Dr. Braymer the HRB approved all the Winchester Region nominations for listing in the Virginia Landmarks Register (VLR).

Chair Hofstra adjourned the morning session just before noon for a 45 minute lunch break.

### **HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD**

Around 1:00 p.m. Vice-Chair Butler brought the HRB back to order after the lunch break.

**Mr. Loth and Ms. Tune presented the following easement items:**

Easements Received since December 7, 2005

Thoroughgood House, Virginia Beach  
Locust Hill, Madison County

Easement Offers to Consider

1. Middleton Inn (The Maples), Washington Historic District, Rappahannock County
2. Fort Bowman (Harmony Hall), Shenandoah County
3. Fort Chiswell Mansion, Wythe County
4. Lick Run, Spotsylvania County (time restraint to get open space easement then list on VLR and NRHP)
5. Peebles Farm/The Breakthrough, Dinwiddie County (time restraint to get open space easement then list on VLR/NRHP)
6. Patteson-Shutte House/Westover Farm, City of Richmond (easement pending listing on VLR/NRHP, standards for restoration to rescue property will be set)

7. 5377 & 5381 Main Street, Stephens City, Frederick County (easement committee recommends not taking an easement)

Easement Amendment to Consider

Level Loop, Rockbridge County (164 acres divided by highway into two lots, set construction intent for both lots)

Vice-Chair Butler asked for any discussion then Ms. Murphy motioned the HRB vote to follow the staff’s recommendation and approve all the easement offers and amendments except the Main Street property. Dr. Braymer seconded so easements 1-6 were approved, 7 was denied, and the Level Loop amendment approved. Ms. Tune then pointed out some updates to the easement policy language and asked the Boards to continue reviewing these.

**Mr. Arnold presented the following Highway marker agenda:**

- New historical highway marker paid for by sponsor:
- 1. Augusta County Training School, Augusta County
  - 2. Aviation Field Yorktown, City of Newport News
  - 3. Brentmoor: The Spillman-Mosby House, Fauquier County (noted last minute date change)
  - 4. Col. Arthur Campbell, Smyth County
  - 5. John Chavis, City of Lexington
  - 6. Eagle's Nest, King George County
  - 7. Fort Huger, Isle of Wight County
  - 8. Fort Loudoun, City of Winchester (noted change to “Seven Year War”)
  - 9. Kilmarnock, Lancaster County (noted addition of the word was)
  - 10. Edith Bolling Wilson, Wythe County

**Replacement historical markers:**

- 1. Campaign of 1781, F-72, Prince Edward County
- 2. History of Worsham, F-65, Prince Edward County
- 3. Lunenburg County/Nottoway County, Z-45, Lunenburg County (noted change to say “lived in the county”)

Mr. Arnold noted last minute text corrections to a couple of markers then thanked all those involved in the marker editing process. Dr. Braymer made the following comments: add a comma after parentheses for Eagles Nest, and hyphenate African-American on Augusta School marker. All the markers were then approved with a motion from Dr. Braymer and a second from Ms. Murphy.

Then with a motion to adjourn from Ms. Murphy and a second from Ms. Flynn, the HRB adjourned for the day.

STATE REVIEW BOARD

**Preliminary Information Applications**

Chair Hofstra brought the SRB to order around 1:00 p.m. in the VDHR Study Collection Room for consideration of the Preliminary Information Applications (informal guidance session).

Board Members (b) and Staff (s) present: Warren Hofstra (b), Carl Lounsbury (b), Madison Spencer (b), Ann Alexander (b), Ann Andrus (s), Camille Bowman (s), David Edwards (s), Joanie Evans (s), Mike Pulice (s), Susan Smead (s), and Marc Wagner (s)

Guests (from sign in sheet):

**All proposals were endorsed, unless noted otherwise in the following comments.**

**Capital Region.....presented by Susan Smead**

- 1. Boxley House, Louisa County, DHR File #054-0242
- 2. Caryswood Mansion, Campbell County, DHR File #015-5147

Board Comments: A complete biography Robert Saunders will have to be developed for the Caryswood nomination in order to make a strong case under Criterion B. Please consult National Register Bulletin 32: Guidelines for Evaluating and Documenting Properties Associated with Significant Persons.

3. Mechum River Farm, Albemarle County, DHR File #002-1632

4. Nance-Major House and Store Complex, Charles City County, DHR File #018-0078

Board Comments: It is not clear from this PIF if the old Charles City County Court House was in use as a court house in 1869 when the Nance Major house and store was constructed. If so then this resource bears the added significance of its role in the political life and culture of Charles City County. In any case, the PIF should make a strong case for the significance of this resource under Criterion A by examining the economic role the store played in the social and economic life of the surrounding community. For additional guidance in developing and describing historical significance please also consult National Register Bulletin 15: How to Apply the National Register Criteria for Evaluation. Bulletin 32: Guidelines for Evaluating and Documenting Properties Associated with Significant Persons is also useful for establishing the significance of historic properties.

**Roanoke Region.....presented by Michael Pulice**

5. R.L. Stone House, Henry County, DHR File #044-5174

Board Comments: Although this PIF provides a complete biography of R. L. Stone, it does not follow through on its assertion that the company he co-founded, the Bassett Furniture Industries, was “America’s most important furniture company of the twentieth century.” The finished nomination should thoroughly develop this claim to Stone’s significance, as it should also more fully explore Stone’s impact on his community and his community’s response. For additional guidance in developing and describing historical significance please also consult National Register Bulletin 15: How to Apply the National Register Criteria for Evaluation. Bulletin 32: Guidelines for Evaluating and Documenting Properties Associated with Significant Persons is also useful for establishing the significance of historic properties.

6. Terrace Apartments, City of Roanoke, DHR File #128-6066

Board Comments: Although this PIF indicates that the Terrace Apartments are significant under Criterion A, it is not clear whether this significance derives from the way in which this resource represents a local response to post–World War II housing demands or to New Deal housing programs. The strongest case could, of course, be made for the significance of the Terrace Apartments as a representation of how federal programs developed initially to address needs created by the Great Depression came to be applied under the altered economic and social circumstances of the 1950s. For additional guidance in developing and describing historical significance please also consult National Register Bulletin 15: How to Apply the National Register Criteria for Evaluation. Bulletin 32: Guidelines for Evaluating and Documenting Properties Associated with Significant Persons is also useful for establishing the significance of historic properties.

**Tidewater Region.....presented by Camille Bowman**

7. Bethlehem Bank Building, City of Emporia, DHR File #109-5021

8. Immanuel Chapel, King and Queen County, DHR File #049-0035

9. Ivy Hill Cemetery, Isle of Wight County, DHR File #300-5005

10. Old Norfolk Public Library, City of Norfolk, DHR File #122-0187

Board Comments: This PIF only states that this resource was constructed with support of the Carnegie Foundation. It does not make a case for the building’s significance as a Carnegie library, nor does it describe the social significance of the Carnegie philanthropies. The completed nomination, of course, will have to address these deficiencies. For additional guidance in developing and describing historical significance please also consult National Register Bulletin 15: How to Apply the National Register Criteria for Evaluation. Bulletin 32: Guidelines for Evaluating and Documenting Properties Associated with Significant Persons is also useful for establishing the significance of historic properties.

11. Rotherwood, Southampton County, DHR File #087-0045

12. Sandswept, City of Virginia Beach, DHR File #134-5089

13. West Point Cemetery, City of Norfolk, DHR File #122-5181

Board Comments: The association of this cemetery with the story of black Union soldiers in the Civil War may lift it to National Register significance under Criterion A. The applicant should be encouraged to explore how this resource can help tell the story of these soldiers and their importance in the social history of both Norfolk and the nation. For additional guidance in developing and describing historical significance please also consult

National Register Bulletin 15: How to Apply the National Register Criteria for Evaluation. Bulletin 32: Guidelines for Evaluating and Documenting Properties Associated with Significant Persons is also useful for establishing the significance of historic properties.

14. White Hall Tavern, James City County, DHR File #047-0041

**Winchester Region.....presented by Joanie Evans**

15. Blue Ridge Farm, Fauquier County, DHR File #030-0894

16. David and Catherine Wampler Driver Farm, Rockingham County, DHR File 082-0116

Board Comments: The association of this property with events and issues of the Civil War might lift it to the level of significance required under National Register Criterion A, but the information provided in this PIF consists largely of hearsay and undocumented oral history. The nomination will have to substantiate the significance of the role the Wampler Driver farm played in the Civil War. For additional guidance in developing and describing historical significance please also consult National Register Bulletin 15: How to Apply the National Register Criteria for Evaluation. Bulletin 32: Guidelines for Evaluating and Documenting Properties Associated with Significant Persons is also useful for establishing the significance of historic properties.

17. Goose Creek Rural Historic District, Boundary Increase, Loudoun County, DHR File #053-0002

Board Comments: This nomination asserts that the properties described therein are significant under National Register Criterion A for their association with people of "regional historic significance." Although these people are enumerated in the narrative that follows, their significance is not discussed or well argued. For building a case for the significance of persons, please see Bulletin 32: Guidelines for Evaluating and Documenting Properties Associated with Significant Persons.

18. Locust Grove, Loudoun County, DHR File #286-5017

19. Longs Chapel, Rockingham County, DHR File #082-5264

Board Comments: Longs Chapel is clearly significant under Criterion A for the National Register, but the nomination will have to explore more fully the role the structure played in the religious and educational life of African-Americans of the Zenda community. For additional guidance in developing and describing historical significance please also consult National Register Bulletin 15: How to Apply the National Register Criteria for Evaluation. Bulletin 32: Guidelines for Evaluating and Documenting Properties Associated with Significant Persons is also useful for establishing the significance of historic properties.

20. Shadow Mountain Farm, Loudoun County, DHR File #053-0111

21. Springs Valley Rural Historic District, Fauquier County, DHR File #030-5427

Board Comments: The case for significance of this historic district under Criteria A and B is carefully constructed by linking themes listed in the opening paragraphs of the Significance Statement to the discussion of these themes in the text that follows. Since the list of relevant themes and individuals is very long, the applicant should be encouraged not to argue too broadly for fear of diluting the case for this historic district with a surfeit of information and to focus on those themes and individuals that make this case most clearly. For additional guidance in developing and describing historical significance please also consult National Register Bulletin 15: How to Apply the National Register Criteria for Evaluation. Bulletin 32: Guidelines for Evaluating and Documenting Properties Associated with Significant Persons is also useful for establishing the significance of historic properties.

**Adjourn-State Review Board**